June 12, 2019

Ms. Tamara Zeier, P.E.
Project Navigator, Ltd.
One Pointe Drive, Suite 320
Brea, California 92821

SUSPENSION OF REMEDY IMPLEMENTATION AND REQUEST FOR ADDITIONAL MEASURES, ASCON LANDFILL SITE, 21641 MAGNOLIA STREET, HUNTINGTON BEACH (SITE CODE: 400007)

Dear Ms. Zeier:

At a June 6, 2019 public meeting, the Department of Toxic Substances Control (DTSC) announced its decision to suspend the Ascon Landfill Site (Site) cleanup until enhanced safeguards are implemented. These safeguards include Project Navigator Ltd. implementing measures to address odors emanating from the Site into Edison High School, across the street from the Site, and into the nearby community. DTSC takes concerns voiced by people in the community seriously and responds as necessary to ensure the protection of public health and the environment. Consequently, additional public health and safety enhancements presented at the public meeting (Attached), must be implemented prior to resumption of onsite activities.

After the public meeting, DTSC communicated with Project Navigator, Ltd., to notify them of its decision and discussed necessary site control measures on June 7, 2019. DTSC based its decision to suspend the work until additional public health and safety enhancements are implemented on three factors. First, people in the community, including officials from the school district and the City of Huntington Beach, have lodged hundreds of complaints about the site. Community members also voiced their strenuous concerns also for hours in the June 6th public meeting that you attended. Community members also voiced similar concerns at a May 15th community meeting held in Huntington Beach’s City Hall.
Second, on May 2, 2019, South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) issued Project Navigator Ltd. a Notice of Violation due to reported and confirmed nuisance odors. Third, for the same reasons, SCAQMD also issued Project Navigator Ltd. an order to stop work for the day on June 6, 2019.

We note that monitoring has not found any chemicals in the air above a level that causes a public health concern. We also note that monitoring and dust and odor suppression activities has continued even after we suspended cleanup work. However, Project Navigator must address community complaints over odors and dust.

As indicated in the attached fact sheet from the Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR), symptoms to odors vary based on people’s sensitivity and young children, the elderly and pregnant women may be more sensitive to odors. Additionally, ATSDR recognizes that odors can cause symptoms and illnesses similar to those expressed by community members during the public meeting and complaints to our office. Therefore, Project Navigator, Ltd. must implement more effective mitigation measures to control odors from the Site.

Upon receipt of this letter, please contact DTSC to arrange for a meeting the week of June 17, 2019 to discuss the scope, schedule and design of mitigation measures included in the attached list.

If you have any questions regarding this project, please contact Xihong Scarlett Zhai, Project Manager, at (714) 484-5316 or by e-mail at Xihong.Zhai@dtsc.ca.gov, or contact me at (714) 484-5484 or by e-mail at Javier.Hinojosa@dtsc.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

Javier Hinojosa
Branch Chief
Brownfields Restoration and School Evaluation Branch
Site Mitigation and Restoration Program

mv/xsz/jh

Attachments

cc: See next page
cc: (via e-mail)

Honorable Assembly Member Petrie-Norris
claire.conlon@asm.ca.gov

Mr. Erik Peterson
Honorable Mayor of Huntington Beach
Erik.Peterson@safeco-city-hb.org

Mr. Clint Harwick
Superintendent
Huntington Beach Unified High School District
charwick@hbuhsd.edu

Mr. Owen Crosby
Assistant Superintendent, Educational Services
Huntington Beach Unified High School District
ocrosby@hbuhsd.edu

Mr. Jeff Starr
Assistant Superintendent, Business Services
Huntington Beach Unified High School District
jstarr@hbuhsd.edu

Terrence Mann
Asst. Deputy Executive Officer,
SCAQMD Office of Compliance and Enforcement
tmann@aqmd.gov

Mr. Derrick J. Alatorre
Deputy Executive Officer
SCAQMD Office of Legislative, Public Affairs & Media
dalatorre@aqmd.gov

Mr. Grant Cope
Acting Deputy Director
DTSC Site Mitigation and Restoration Program – Sacramento
Grant.Cope@dtsc.ca.gov

Mr. Peter Garcia
Division Chief
DTSC Site Mitigation and Restoration Program – Cypress
Peter.Garcia@dtsc.ca.gov
cc:  (via e-mail)

Mr. Shahir Haddad  
Supervising Engineer  
DTSC Brownfields Restoration and School Evaluation Branch – Cypress  
Shahir.Haddad@dtsc.ca.gov

Ms. Scarlett Xihong Zhai  
Project Manager  
DTSC Brownfields Restoration and School Evaluation Branch – Cypress  
Xihong.Zhai@dtsc.ca.gov

Dr. Donald Greenlee  
Staff Toxicologist  
DTSC Human and Ecological Risk Office – Chatsworth  
Donald.Greenlee@dtsc.ca.gov

Brownfields Restoration and School Evaluation Team Reading File – Cypress
On June 6, 2019, the Department of Toxic Substances Control (DTSC) suspended cleanup work at the Ascon Landfill site in Huntington Beach, California.

DTSC is suspending all work until the following public health and safety enhancements occur:

1. DTSC approves the evaluation and use of a feasible tenting or enclosure system to control odors where excavation of contaminated soil occurs.

2. A 16-foot high fence is constructed at the site.

3. DTSC approves actions to ensure that contaminated soil is covered or solidified daily.

4. DTSC approves an air monitoring program that includes additional heavy metals known to occur at the site.

5. DTSC approves expanding the range of off-site air monitoring activities, including all nearby schools.

6. DTSC approves a system to rapidly respond to odor and dust complaints by investigating and then shutting down and correcting work practices that generate odor or dust. The system must also provide timely reports on follow-up work to the individuals who reported the odor or dust complaint.

7. A technical advisor is hired to advise the community, enhance their technical resources and to help improve DTSC’s communications with the public.

8. DTSC approves a review of the project’s air monitoring data validation methodologies used to ensure the quality of monitoring results.

9. DTSC approves the testing of on-site concrete material for asbestos and, if testing identifies any threats, DTSC will immediately require actions to address the threat.

10. DTSC holds a public meeting before cleanup work is re-started.
Environmental Odors

Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ)

**What are environmental odors?**

Many substances in the environment can produce odors. You typically smell these odors when you are outdoors and sometimes when you are indoors with your windows open. You may smell and react to certain chemicals in the air before they are at harmful levels. Those odors can become a nuisance and bother people, causing temporary symptoms such as headache and nausea. Other odors can be toxic and cause harmful health effects.

**Where do environmental odors come from?**

Environmental odors can come from many sources:

- **Animals:** Confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs)
- **Human activities:** Compost, sewage, garbage, fires, household cleaning agents
- **Industry:** Oil refineries, landfills, paper mills, wastewater treatment plants
- **Nature:** Moist soil, gardens, fires
- **Vehicles:** Diesel exhaust

**Can environmental odors make me sick?**

Everyone reacts to odors differently. Some people are more sensitive to environmental odors than others. When you are more sensitive to an odor, you may have symptoms even at a low concentration of the odor in air. In general, as concentration levels increase, more people will have symptoms.

**What symptoms can I expect?**

Symptoms vary based on your sensitivity to the odor. In most cases, symptoms will depend on the type of substance, its concentration in air, how often exposure occurs (frequency), how long exposure lasts (duration), your age, and your state of health.

Young children, the elderly, and pregnant women may be more sensitive to odors. In general, the most common symptoms are

- Headaches
- Nasal congestion
- Eye, nose, and throat irritation
- Hoarseness, sore throat
- Cough
- Chest tightness
- Shortness of breath
- Wheezing
- Heart Palpitations
- Nausea
- Drowsiness
- Mental depression

These symptoms generally occur at the time of exposure. Their intensity will depend on the concentration of the odor in air, how often you smell it, and how long exposure lasts.
If the concentration of an odor in air is **below levels of irritation** (levels known to cause eye, nose, or throat irritation in people), the symptoms will pass when you move out of the exposure area.

If the concentration of an odor in air is **at or above levels of irritation** and the exposure duration is longer, the symptoms may last after moving out of the exposure area.

### Are all environmental odors toxic?

No. Toxicity is the degree to which a substance (a toxin) can harm humans or animals. The following factors affect toxicity.

**Are Environmental Odors Toxic Factsheet** [PDF – 2MB]

- Toxicity depends on the amount of a substance (concentration) in the air you breathe, how often (frequency) you breathe that air, and how much time (duration) you spend breathing that air.
- If a substance level in air is high, happens often, and last a long time, the odor can become toxic and cause adverse health effects.
- If those conditions do not exist, odors are generally not toxic.
- If you are sensitive to environmental odors, you may react to low concentrations of a substance in air. The length of exposure is important whether you are sensitive or not.

For more information on toxic substances, visit ATSDR's [Toxic Substances Portal](http://www.atsdr.cdc.gov).

### How do I know what substance I am smelling?

Visit the “What is that odor?” section of this website. There you can describe an odor and find the substance(s) that produce that odor. You can also look up a specific substance and find a description of its odor.

To find chemicals released in your area, you can search EPA's [Toxic Release Inventory (TRI)](http://www.epa.gov/ttn/atw/pollsour.html).

### Are environmental odors regulated in the United States?

In general, no. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) regulates pollutants in outdoor air through the National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS). The NAAQS regulates:

- Carbon monoxide (CO)
- Lead (Pb)
- Nitrogen dioxide (NO$_2$)
- Ozone (O$_3$)
- Particulate Matter (PM) and Sulfur dioxide (SO$_2$).

Sulfur dioxide is the only regulated air pollutant with a strong, pungent odor.

Under the Clean Air Act, EPA must control 187 hazardous air pollutants, also known as toxic air pollutants or air toxics. EPA controls those chemicals for their toxicity, not for their odor. EPA requires them to be controlled at the source that generates the emissions. See the EPA website for more information: [http://www.epa.gov/ttn/atw/pollsour.html](http://www.epa.gov/ttn/atw/pollsour.html).

Although environmental odors are not nationally regulated in the United States, many cities and local governments have established nuisance odor regulations. You can find more information by contacting your city or county health department or your state environmental department.

### Can I petition ATSDR to ask for an evaluation of environmental odors in my neighborhood?
ATSDR develops public health consultations about hazardous waste sites or facilities. You can petition ATSDR to evaluate environmental health exposures in your community. However, ATSDR needs available environmental sampling data to conduct an evaluation. These data are typically gathered by the EPA or a state environmental regulatory agency.

Learn more about

- How community members and government agencies can petition ATSDR
- ATSDR mandates

What can ATSDR do to help with environmental odors in my neighborhood?

If ATSDR is working in your neighborhood to assess environmental exposures, the agency can help by doing one or more of the following:

- Working with the facility producing the odors or local regulators to
  - Recommend changes in times of operation, for example suspending or reducing the odor-producing operations during the time(s) of the day or week when the odors are worse (as noted in the odor diaries).
  - Recommend ways to reduce emissions. Examples include planting trees, modifying engineering techniques, increasing stack height, or changing filters more frequently.

- Providing environmental health education to primary care providers in the area

- Recommending personal actions to reduce exposure such as
  - Staying indoors when environmental odors are strong
  - Exercising indoors on bad odor days
  - Leaving the area for a few hours

What can my community do about environmental odors?

- You can keep personal odor diaries to track the odors in the community.
- You can organize to assess the effect environmental odors have on your community.
- You can appeal to local government for policy changes.
- You can appeal to industry to make operational changes to reduce odors.

Odor diaries can help distinguish odor types and times of the day or night when odors are worse. See our Air Pollution Odor Diary webpage for more information about odor diaries.

I have asthma. Can environmental odors make my asthma worse?

In many cases, yes, odors can make asthma worse. Using your inhaler, staying indoors, or leaving the area for a few hours can help.

I have chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) or emphysema. Can environmental odors make my COPD or emphysema worse?
In many cases, yes, odors can make COPD or emphysema worse. Using your inhalers, staying indoors, or leaving the area for a few hours can help.

**I am pregnant. Can environmental odors affect the baby I am carrying?**

In general, the effect on an unborn baby depends on the amount of substance (concentration) in the air that you are breathing, how often (frequency) you are breathing that air, how much time (duration) you spend breathing that air, and the stage in your pregnancy (the baby is more vulnerable during the first trimester).

Staying indoors during bad odor days or leaving the area for a few hours can help.

**Are children more sensitive to the effects of environmental odors?**

They may be. Young children have a faster breathing rate than adults, so they breathe in more of the odors.

Some chemicals producing the environmental odors can be heavier than air and stay closer to the ground where children play. Because children are small and play or crawl on the ground, they can have higher exposure to these odors-producing chemicals.

**Are elderly people more sensitive to the effects of environmental odors?**

They may be. The sense of smell decreases with age. Sometimes elderly people may not be able to smell environmental odors, so they continue to stay in an affected area. Symptoms will depend on their health status, amount of substance (concentration) in the air that they are breathing, how often (frequency) they are breathing that air, and how much time (duration) they spend breathing that air.

**I walk/jog for exercise in my neighborhood. Am I at risk for developing environmental odor symptoms?**

In general, developing odor symptoms depends on the amount of a substance (concentration) in the air that you are breathing, how often (frequency) you are breathing that air, and how much time (duration) you spend breathing that air. However, if you are sensitive to environmental odors, any level of odor may make you feel sick. Jogging and other forms of exercise increase your breathing rate, making you breathe in more of the odor. During bad odor days, exercising indoors or in another location can help.